

Tabel of Contents

Research in Review: A Brief Synopsis	11
Forschungsbilanz und Zusammenfassung	14
Acknowledgements	18
Preface to the Research	20
Transliteration, Language, and Spelling	20
Researcher Biases	20
Community Concerns	22
1 The Emergence of Participatory Development in Development Theory and Approaches	24
1.1 Researching Community Driven Development in Afghanistan	24
1.2 Historical Shifts in Development Theory and Approaches	27
1.2.1 The Emergence of Development Studies Following World War II	28
1.2.2 Different Development Approaches in the Early Years: Community Development and Modernization Theory	33
1.2.3 Modernization Theory: Laying the Foundation of Mainstream Development Approaches	37
1.2.4 Dependency Theory Rises in Response to the Failures of Modernization Theory	43
1.2.5 Expanding the Definition of Development beyond Economics: Shifts towards Participation	52
1.2.6 NIEO and Efforts to Shift Power to the Periphery	54
1.2.7 Adding to Seers: Support for More Expansive Development Indicators	56
1.2.8 Basic Needs Approach: Introduction of Individuals into the Development Discourse	57
1.2.9 World System Theory: Introducing More Nuance into Dependency Theory and Presenting a Multi-directional Model of Development	62
1.2.10 Belief in the Forces of the Market: Neo-liberal Approaches Dominate	64

1.3	Movement towards Participatory Development	67
1.3.1	Participatory Approaches: People as Agents of Change	67
1.3.2	Human Development at Center Stage and a New Development Index	68
1.3.3	Human Security: Development Creating Security	73
1.3.4	Participatory Development: Development Centered Around the Agent	75
1.3.5	Post-Development: Problematizing “Development”	79
1.3.6	Extracting Meaning: Concluding Remarks on the History of Development Theory and Approaches	81
1.4	Participatory Development’s Rise in the Wake of Failed Top-Down Approaches	83
1.5	Exploration of Participatory Development in the Literature	86
1.5.1	Definitions of Participatory Development	88
1.5.2	The Process of Participation	95
1.5.3	Connecting Participatory Approaches and Effectiveness	99
1.5.4	Criticisms of Participatory Development	107
1.6	Extracting Meaning: The Historical Review	114
2	Situating the Research into a Framework of Analysis	117
2.1	Research Stemming from a Historical Base and Specific Levels of Analysis	118
2.2	Inserting the Independent Variable: The National Solidarity Programme	121
2.3	Four Areas of Investigation	122
2.3.1	Personal Security	124
2.3.2	Economic Security	125
2.3.3	Social Security	126
2.3.4	Empowerment	128
2.4	The Additional Value and Importance of Applying a Gender Lens	131
2.5	Extracting Meaning: The Analytical Framework	132

3	A Predominantly Qualitative Methodological Approach	135
3.1	Methodological Demands of the Research Question	135
3.2	Limitations of the Methodological Approach	137
3.3	Empirical Research Tools and Sampling	139
3.3.1	The Centrality of the Household: The Semi-Structured Household Survey	139
3.3.2	Understanding a Community and Its Environs: The Research Tools	145
3.3.3	Gaining Access and Permission	153
3.4	Difficulties and Challenges Encountered During the Fieldwork	155
3.4.1	Security	155
3.4.2	Gender Segregation	157
3.4.3	Research Assistants and Working in Translation	159
3.4.4	Community Suspicions and Expectations	160
3.5	Identifying the Fieldwork Research Location	161
3.5.1	Selection of Northern Afghanistan	161
3.5.2	Selection of Khulm District, Shah Raheem Community	164
3.6	Bringing Together the Different Means of Data Collection	166
4	A Case Study Situated in Afghanistan	168
4.1	The Dominance of Modernization Theory in Historical Development Efforts	168
4.1.1	Early Modernization Efforts (1919-1945)	169
4.1.2	Cold War Competition, Politics, and Development Aid Intertwine (1946-1978)	176
4.1.3	Communist Rule: Afghanistan Becomes a Battleground (1978-1992)	188
4.1.4	Mujahideen “Governance” and the Internal Destruction of Afghanistan’s Infrastructural Assets (1992-1996)	196
4.1.5	Taliban Control and Further Destruction of the State’s Assets (1996-2001)	198
4.1.6	Post-Taliban: A Tidal Wave of Development Efforts (2001 to present)	202

4.2	Relics of Past Development Efforts and Conflict: The Current Development Situation	207
4.2.1	Personal Security: A Country at War	208
4.2.2	Economic Security: A Volatile Situation	213
4.2.3	Social Security: The Loosening of Ties	217
4.2.4	Empowerment and the Political Situation: A Government at Risk	218
4.3	Is a Participatory Development Approach an Answer to Afghanistan's Development Problems? Introduction to the National Solidarity Programme	226
4.3.1	History of the National Solidarity Programme.....	230
4.3.2	Practicalities of How the National Solidarity Programme Works	232
4.4	Extracting Meaning: Embedding the Research in Afghanistan ..	250
5	A District at the Crossroads: Exploring Khulm District	251
5.1	A Historical Perspective of Khulm as an Oasis, a Marketplace, and a Battleground	252
5.1.1	Exploring the Establishment of Khulm and its Early History	252
5.1.2	The 20th Century, Prior to the Saur Revolution.....	260
5.1.3	Khulm District under the PDPA Government: Violence Erupts (1978-1992)	264
5.1.4	Mujahideen Gain Political Power in Khulm District (1992-1996)	279
5.1.5	Khulm District under the Taliban: Negative Perceptions of Securities (1996-2001)	286
5.1.6	Khulm District in the Post-Taliban Time Period: Improving Perceptions of Securities (2001-present)	294
5.2	Extracting Meaning: Understanding the Research Area	319
6	The Implementation of the National Solidarity Programme in Shah Raheem: Introducing the Independent Variable.....	325
6.1	Community Mobilization in Shah Raheem	325
6.1.1	Three Villages Form One Community for the NSP	325
6.1.2	Introduction of the NSP into the Community of Shah Raheem	329
6.1.3	CDC Elections in Shah Raheem: Conflicting Understandings	333
6.1.4	Development Subproject Prioritization	340
6.2	NSP Program Implementation and Management in Shah Raheem	344

6.2.1	NSP Meetings: Inclusion and Exclusion	344
6.2.2	NSP Trainings: Limited Information and Impact	350
6.2.3	NSP Development Projects in Shah Raheem: Infrastructure Built and Mostly Utilized	352
6.2.4	Management and Maintenance of the Subprojects: A Male Endeavour	363
6.2.5	Sustainability of the NSP CDCs: Dependency on External Inputs	365
6.2.6	Shah Raheem’s Internal Evaluation of the NSP: Positive Perceptions ..	368
6.3	Extracting Meaning: Evaluating the Implementation of the NSP in Shah Raheem	370
7	The Impact of the NSP on the Four Areas of Investigation in Shah Raheem	373
7.1	Personal Security: A Lack of Strong Positive or Negative Impacts	373
7.2	Economic Security: Minimal Positive Movements	379
7.3	Social Security: Small Positive Shifts for Some	383
7.3.1	Bonding Social Capital: Increased Connections for the Males of Shah Raheem	384
7.3.2	Bridging Social Capital: Limited Changes in Relationships with Outsiders	389
7.4	Empowerment: Only Slightly Impacted	395
7.4.1	Access to Information Improved for Some	396
7.4.2	Inclusion and Participation is Selective	401
7.4.3	Accountability is Weak	405
7.4.4	Capacity to Organize is Not Strongly in Evidence	408
7.5	Summarizing the Findings: The NSP’s Limited Impact on the Areas of Investigation	412
8	Bringing the Research into Perspective	415
8.1	Applicability of this Research	415
8.1.1	Shah Raheem as Representative of NSP Communities in Khulm District	415
8.1.2	Shah Raheem as Representative of NSP Communities in General: Evidence of Inaccurate Data and Biases	417
8.2	Reviewing the Research Findings	421

8.2.1	Shah Raheem: Incremental Changes	421
8.2.2	The NSP and Afghanistan: Raising Concerns	423
8.2.3	Participatory Development in General: Hidden Realities	425
8.3	Coming to a Close: The NSP in Perspective	430
Annex A:	NSP Form 1: Community Profile	431
Annex B:	NSP Form 2: CDC Election and Composition	433
Annex C:	NSP Form 5: Certification of Registration of CDC	438
Annex D:	NSP Form 6: Community Development Plan	441
Annex E:	NSP Form 7: Subproject Proposal	444
Annex F:	Household Survey Questionnaire	453
Annex G:	Household Survey Participants	458
Annex H:	Market Survey Questionnaire	460
Annex I:	Shopkeeper Questionnaire	461
Annex J:	Shopkeeper Questionnaire Participants	462
Annex K:	Facilitating Partner Staff Key Informant Interview Participants	463
Annex L:	Community Member Key Informant Interview Participants	464
Annex M:	External Key Informant Interview Participants	465
Annex N:	Focus Group Discussions Held	466
Annex O:	Map of the Khulm River Basin	467
Annex P:	Transliteration of the Persian Alphabet	468
	Glossary of Terms	469
	Acronyms	474
	List of Figures	479
	List of Photos	481
	Empirical and Primary Sources Consulted and Utilized	482
	Secondary Sources Consulted and Cited	485