

Contents

Editorial	7
Acknowledgements	9
Contents	11
Abbreviations	19
Introduction	21

PART I:

Transformation of State and Social Property into Private Property in Post-Communist Countries

Chapter 1:

The Idea, Necessity and Preconditions of Transforming Centrally Planned Economies to Market Economies	31
1.1 General Overview	31
1.2 Why to Privatize? Reasons for Transformation of State and Social Property into Private Property	31
1.2.1 Arguments for Privatization	33
1.2.2 Arguments against Privatization	37
1.2.3 A Brief Summary of Arguments in favour of and against Privatization	38
1.3 The Concept of Privatization	38
1.4 Aims and Objectives of Privatization in Post-Communist Transformation	41
1.5 Preconditions for a Functioning and Successful Privatization Process and Achieving its Goals: Institutional Changes for Supporting a Market Economy	42
1.5.1 Political and Economic Stability	43
1.5.2 Legislative Changes: The Open Door to a Free Market and its Harmonization with International Standards Ensuring Competition	44
1.5.3 Establishment of a Free Market, Creation of Competition and Ensuring the Transparency of the Privatization Process	46
1.6 How to Privatize? Conflicts of Interests in the Privatization Process	48
1.6.1 The Conflicts of Interests Need to be Resolved	48
1.6.2 Dilemmas About Restitution	49
1.6.3 The Dilemma of the Employee Ownership in Privatization	51
1.6.4 The Conflicts Between Rapid and Gradual Reforms	51
1.7 Conclusions	53

Chapter 2:

Privatization Methods without Restitution: The Economic, Social and Justice Impact on the Privatization Approaches

2.1	The Experiences of Post-Communist States in the Choice of Privatization Methods	55
2.1.1	Lack of a Unique Method of Transformation of Property	55
2.1.2	Why Different Methods of Privatization are Used?	57
2.2	Specific Analysis of Three Methods of Privatization: Inside Privatization (MEBO), Mass Privatization (Voucher Privatization) and Sale of Assets to Investors	59
2.2.1	The Concept of Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	60
2.2.2	The Concept of Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of Citizens in the Privatization Process	61
2.2.3	The Concept of Sale of the Assets to Outsiders – Domestic or Foreign Investors	61
2.3	Hungary	62
2.3.1	Background	62
2.3.2	Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	64
2.3.3	Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of the Citizens in the Privatization Process	65
2.3.4	Sale of Asset to Outsiders – Domestic or Foreign Investors	65
2.4	The Czech Republic	66
2.4.1	Background	66
2.4.2	Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	67
2.4.3	Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of the Citizens in the Privatization Process	68
2.4.4	Sale of Assets to Outsiders – Domestic and/or Foreign Investors	69
2.5	Former East Germany	70
2.5.1	Background	70
2.5.2	Sale of Assets to Outsiders – Domestic or Foreign Investors	71
2.5.3	Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	73
2.6	Poland	74
2.6.1	Background	74
2.6.2	Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	76
2.6.3	Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of the Citizens in the Privatization Process	76
2.6.4	Sale of Assets to Outsiders – Domestic and/or Foreign Investors	77
2.7	Transformation of Property in Three Former Yugoslav Republics: Slovenia, Croatia, and FYR Macedonia	77

2.7.1 General Overview	77
2.7.2 Slovenia	78
2.7.2.1 Background	78
2.7.2.2 Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	80
2.7.2.3 Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of the Citizens in the Privatization Process	81
2.7.2.4 Sale of Assets to Outsiders – Domestic and/or Foreign Investors	82
2.7.3 Croatia	82
2.7.3.1 Background	82
2.7.3.2 Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	84
2.7.3.3 Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of the Citizens in the Privatization Process	85
2.7.3.4 Sales of Assets to Outsiders – Domestic and/or Foreign Investors	85
2.7.4 FYR Macedonia	86
2.7.4.1 Background	86
2.7.4.2 Insider Privatization – MEBO: Employee Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property	88
2.7.4.3 Mass-Privatization (Voucher Privatization): The Involvement of the Citizens in the Privatization Process	89
2.7.4.4 Sale of Assets to Outsiders – Domestic and/or Foreign Investors	89
2.8 Conclusions	90

Chapter 3:

Transformation of Property through Restitution as a Solution for the Protection of Property Rights of Former Owners:

The Experience of Several Post-Communist Countries	93
3.1 Relations between Privatization and Restitution (Denationalization)	93
3.2 Restitution and Treatment of Property Rights of Former Owners in some Post-Communist Countries with a Centrally Planned Economy and the Concept of State Property	96
3.2.1 Overview	96
3.2.2 Hungary	97
3.2.2.1 Legal Basis for Restitution	97
3.2.2.2 The Forms of Restitution	97
3.2.2.3 The Extension of Restitution and Eligible Persons for Restitution	98
3.2.2.4 Restitution for Religious Organizations	99
3.2.2.5 Summary	99

3.2.3 The Czech Republic	99
3.2.3.1 Legal Basis for Restitution	100
3.2.3.2 Forms of Restitution	100
3.2.3.3 The Extension of Restitution and Eligible Persons for Restitution	101
3.2.3.4 Restitution for Religious Organizations	101
3.2.3.5 Summary	102
3.2.4 Former East Germany	102
3.2.4.1 Legal Basis for Restitution	102
3.2.4.2 Forms of Restitution	103
3.2.4.3 The Extension of Restitution and Eligible Persons for Restitution	104
3.2.4.4 Restitution for Religious Organizations	105
3.2.4.5 Summary	105
3.2.5 Poland	105
3.2.5.1 Legal Basis for restitution	106
3.2.5.2 Possible Forms for Restitution and Restitution Debates	106
3.2.5.3 Restitution for Religious Organizations	107
3.2.5.4 Summary	107
3.3 Restitution and Treatment of Property Rights of Former Owners in Post-Comunist Countries with Reference to Social Property: Specific Focus in Former Yugoslav Republics – Slovenia, Croatia, and FYR Macedonia	108
3.3.1 Slovenia	108
3.3.1.1 Legal Basis for Restitution	108
3.3.1.2 Forms of Restitution	108
3.3.1.3 The Extension of Restitution and Eligible Persons for Restitution	109
3.3.1.4 Restitution for Religious Organizations	110
3.3.1.5 Summary	110
3.3.2 Croatia	110
3.3.2.1 Legal Basis for Restitution	111
3.3.2.2 Forms of Restitution	111
3.3.2.3 The Extension of Restitution and Eligible Persons for Restitution	112
3.3.2.4 Restitution for Religious Organizations	112
3.3.2.5 Summary	113
3.3.3 FYR Macedonia	113
3.3.3.1 Legal Basis for Restitution	113
3.3.3.2 Forms of Restitution	114
3.3.3.3 The Extension of Restitution and Eligible Persons for Restitution	115
3.3.3.4 Restitution for Religious Organizations	116
3.3.3.5 Summary	116

3.4	Conclusions	116
Chapter 4:		
	The Influence of International Instruments for the Protection of Private Ownership in the Process of Transformation of Property: Its Effects in Cases of Restitution	119
4.1	Overview	119
4.2	The Practice of the Strasbourg Bodies (European Commission of Human Rights and European Court of Human Rights) Related to Restitution of Property: Review of Restitution Cases in Relation to the European Convention on Human Rights	121
4.2.1	Ratione Temporis	122
4.2.2	Ratione Materiae	124
4.2.3	Equal Treatment	127
4.2.4	Duty to Restitute	128
4.3	The Impact of UN Acts and the Practice of the UN Human Rights Committee Related to the Restitution Issue	129
4.4	The Similarities and Differences of the Decisions of the Strasbourg Bodies and the UN Human Rights Commission in Dealing with Restitution Cases	133
4.4.1	The Similarities Regarding the Extension of the Conventions Effect in Time	133
4.4.2	The Differences on the Basis of Various Implementations of the Rules of the Relevant Conventions to Equal Protection before the Law to all Persons	133
4.4.3	Similarities Regarding Amount of Compensation for Restitution	135
4.5	Conclusions	135

PART II:

Transformation of Social Property in Kosovo: Kosovo as a *Sui Generis* Case of Privatization

Chapter 5:		
	The Concept of Social Property and its Development in Kosovo	139
5.1	Background	139
5.2	Legal Status of Social Property in Kosovo	140
5.2.1	Establishment of Socialist Ownership and Agrarian Reforms	141
5.2.2	Nationalization of Private Commercial Enterprises	144
5.2.3	Nationalization of Forests and Pastures as well as Ownership Limitation in Lands	144
5.2.4	Establishment of Cooperatives and Cooperative Relations	145
5.3	Status of Socialist Ownership in Kosovo from 1950-1974 and Establishment of Self-Management System in Enterprises	147
5.3.1	Economic Reforms, Reorganization of Enterprises and Self-Management System in Enterprises	147

5.3.2	Ownership Transformations and Establishment of Self-Management System in Enterprises	148
5.4	The Concept of Social Property According to the 1974 Constitution of Kosovo	149
5.4.1	The Concept of Social Ownership According to the 1974 Kosovo's Constitution until 1989	149
5.4.2	Forms of Ownership According to Constitutional and Legal Regulation after 1974	151
5.4.3	Forms of Social Ownership in Immovable Property	152
5.4.3.1	Socially Owned Agricultural Land	152
5.4.3.2	Socially Owned Construction (Industrial) Land	152
5.4.3.3	Socially Owned Apartments	153
5.4.3.4	Social Business Premises	154
5.5	Legal Concept of Social Ownership under the Constitution of 1974: Differences and Similarities with State Property	154
5.5.1	Legal Concept	154
5.5.2	Some Legal Arguments for Identification of Social Property as State Property	157
5.6	The Status of Social Property in Kosovo from 1989 to 1999	159
5.7	Conclusions	160
Chapter 6:		
Privatization of Socially Owned Property in Kosovo		161
6.1	Background	161
6.2	Institutional Framework	162
6.2.1	UNMIK Administration	162
6.2.2	Kosovo Governmental Structure: Provisional Institutions of Self-Government (PISG) of the Republic of Kosovo	163
6.2.3	Legal Framework: Diffused Legal Bases	164
6.3	The Impact of Unresolved Political Status in the Privatization Process: The Lack of Debate on Privatization	166
6.4	Economic Environment: Ruined Economy and Low Living Standards During the Privatization Process	168
6.5	Social Property and Challenges Towards Administration and Privatization under the UNMIK Authority	170
6.5.1	The Question of Administration of SOEs	171
6.5.2	Commercialization of SOEs	171
6.6	Social Property and the Question of Privatization under the UNMIK Authority	172
6.6.1	Background	172
6.6.2	Legal Challenges Regarding Privatization of SOEs	173

6.6.3 The Question of the Privatization Model: The Critical Assessment of the Privatization Proposals	176
6.7 Privatization of Social Property under the Kosovo Trust Agency	177
6.7.1 Establishment of the Kosovo Trust Agency: The Legal Status and its Function	177
6.7.2 Administration of POEs and SOEs	179
6.7.3 Privatization of SOEs	180
6.7.4 Sale of Assets to Investors	180
6.7.4.1 Privatization According to the Spin-Off Model	180
6.7.4.2 Liquidation	184
6.7.4.3 Long Term Leases	184
6.8 Insider Privatization: Employee Ownership in the Privatization Process	184
6.9 Transformation of Social Immovable Property: The Right to Use the Land for 99 Years	185
6.10 Socially Owned Apartments and Construction Land	186
6.11 Privatization Process under the Privatization Agency of Kosovo	187
6.12 Conclusions	189
Chapter 7:	
Resolving Ownership Disputes During Privatization: The Lack of Treatment of Restitution	191
7.1 Overview	191
7.2 The Establishment of the Special Chamber	191
7.3 The Critical Assessment of Resolving Ownership Claims over the Privatized Property	192
7.3.1 Resolving Property Disputes Regarding the SOEs Transformed during the Milosevic Regime 1989-1999	193
7.3.2 Resolving Disputes Regarding Employees' Rights during Privatization of Property	195
7.4 The Treatment of the Former Owners' Claims Regarding Restitution of Property	196
7.4.1 Background	196
7.4.2 The Lack of Legal Framework for Resolving the Restitution Issue	197
7.4.3 The Negative Effect of the Lack of Legal Framework	198
7.4.4 The Difficulties of Resolving the Issue of Restitution of Former Owners	198
7.4.5 Documents to Verify the Ownership Title	200
7.4.5.1 System of Tapou (Tapia)	200
7.4.5.2 Registering the Property: Possession Certificate and Ownership Certificate	201
7.4.5.3 Books of Tabulation and the Court's Archive	203
7.4.5.4 De facto Possession (Prescription)	203

7.4.6 The Need to Resolve the Restitution of Property of the Former Owners	203
7.4.7 Opportunities of Resolving the Restitution Problem	204
7.4.7.1 Extension of Restitution	205
7.4.7.2 Compensation	205
7.5 Conclusions	206
Chapter 8:	
General Conclusions	209
Bibliography	225
Research and Study Reports	236
Legal Acts	238